Effects of L1 and L2 Subtitled English Movies on Pre-Intermediate Learners' Comprehension and Speaking Abilities

Mohammadreza Valizadeh
Department of Translation and Interpretation (English), Faculty of Humanities, Cappadocia University, Cappadocia, Turkey, 50420.
E-mail : mrvalizadeh2015@gmail.com

Abstract
The review of the related studies on the advantages of subtitled movies in EFL classrooms indicates that there is no consensus among the researchers. While one group of researchers advocates L2 subtitled movies, the other group supports the use of L1 subtitled movies. This study addressed the impact of L1 and L2 subtitled movies on the language learners' comprehension of and speaking about the movies. A mixed-method research design was used. Three groups of participants (60 pre-intermediate learners) were exposed to three types of subtitles: L1 (Turkish), L2 (English), and standard (no subtitles). The data were collected through researcher-developed tests of comprehension and speaking as well as a semi-structured interview checklist. Results of ANOVA tests revealed that L1 subtitled movies were more effective than L2 subtitled movies which in turn were more effective than original movies. The thematic analysis of the interviews also showed that the participants found subtitled movies interesting, motivating, and authentic. In conclusion, subtitled movies can serve as mediators and facilitators. Results can be practically implied by EFL teachers and learners.

Keywords: L1 subtitled; L2 subtitled; movies; comprehension ability; pre-intermediate learners; speaking ability.

1. Introduction

With the advent of technology and the increasing access to computers, TV, video equipment, and online and offline audio-visual materials, EFL teachers have found it easy and possible to use audio-visual materials to teach the English language to EFL learners with different proficiency levels, and they have frequently used them effectively in language classes (Aksu-Ataç & Köprülü-Günay, 2018; Napikul, et al., 2018; Rokni & Ataee, 2014). Champoux (1999) believed movies are a comfortable familiar medium for motivating EFL learners and making them interested in learning. Movies can provide the students with powerful experiences which they can rarely have

in a classroom (Blasco, et al., 2006; Mardani & Najmabadi, 2015). It has also been claimed that films can provoke a good discussion, assessment of one's values and self if the scenes have strong emotional content (Blasco et al., 2006).

It can also be seen that the way we communicate has been greatly changed by Multimedia technology. Multimedia has brought with it a "growing number of skilled users, who have become independent learners and many of them want to study foreign languages" (Caimi, 2015, p. 11). Moreover, the technological advances and innovations within the last two decades made interactive access to resource materials, most particularly in the case of "generating subtitles, which is a strong competitor with other forms of fluid textual and multimodal support, due to computer-generated transcripts and hyperlinked texts" (Danan, 2015, p. 42). Unlike time-consuming and intricate practices of adding subtitles to videos or clips in the past, recently, viewers can manipulate the subtitles with their language on most digital television programs and DVDs. Similarly, as Frumuselu, et al. (2015) believed, the availability of online audiovisual materials that can be downloaded and retrieved from different sites makes the handling of clips and subtitles even more accessible by users from any corner of the world.

Psychologists have argued for the impact of films on the cognitive learning of students in the classroom. For instance, Blasco et al. (2006) suggested that the use of films in learning and teaching is important for provoking the attitudes and reflective processes in the learners. Some researchers (Butler, et al. 2009) also argued that learners' ability to recall and retain information as well as satisfaction with the learning experience is significantly higher in the classrooms in which film is an integral part of the learning and teaching activities. In the same vein, Champoux (1999) argued that films offer both affective and cognitive experiences in the classroom. Furthermore, film scenes could be very helpful in enhancing the analytical skills of students and changing their attitudes as well as a worldview because they connect theories to realistic situations.

Watching films with L1 subtitles over a prolonged period seems to promote incidental learning (Danan, 2015; Talaván, 2013; Van de Poel & D'Ydewalle, 2001). Also, films with texts and L2 audio seem to stimulate language acquisition, especially listening comprehension and vocabulary, because spoken forms can be reinforced on screen by language subtitles. A large number of studies have also verified the benefits of using captions upon reading skills in both learners' L1 and L2 (e.g., Hefer, 2013; Kothari, 2008; Kothari, et al., 2002).

Rokni and Ataee (2014) also argued that using videos and films as a learning tool received the attraction of researchers and even teachers in applying the tools successfully in a variety of educational environments. The review of the related

literature shows that there is much research on the use of movies subtitled in the target language in EFL classes. That is, the use of L2 subtitled movies in EFL classes has been studied to a great extent. However, to the best of the researcher's knowledge, it is not appropriately known whether or not the use of L2 subtitled movies can significantly improve oral production and listening comprehension of Turkish EFL learners. More importantly, the use of English language movies subtitled in the students' first language (L1) has not been sufficiently studied. In other words, it is not known whether L1 subtitled English movies can significantly contribute to the improvement of EFL learners' oral language production and recognition? Furthermore, it is not known whether L1 and L2 subtitled movies have the same impact on improving oral language production and recognition of Turkish EFL learners. Last but not the least, the perceptions of EFL learners about the effectiveness of L1 and L2 subtitled movies have not been explored yet. In line with this gap, the following research questions were raised:

1. Does watching L1 and L2 subtitled English movies have any statistically significant impact on improving EFL learners' speaking about movies?

2. Does watching L1 and L2 subtitled English movies have any statistically significant impact on EFL learners' comprehension of movies?

3. How do pre-intermediate Turkish EFL learners perceive the roles of L1 and L2 subtitled movies in enhancing their abilities to speak about and comprehend movies?

2. Review of the Literature
2.1. Theoretical Background

Multimedia Learning Theory proposed by Mayer (2009) supported the use of subtitles as teaching and learning in the foreign language classroom. The main assumption of dual-channel assumption theory is that learners learn better from words associated with pictures than from words alone. This theory is deeply rooted in Paivio's (1986) bilingual Dual Coding Theory, which claims that the imagery and verbal system, composed of events and nonverbal objects, are linked by referential connections but they are functionally independent. Multimedia learning is also supported by Sweller's (2005) Theory of Cognitive Load, which assumes that learning occurs much better under conditions that are in line with the cognitive architecture of human beings. Therefore, through exposing learners to different modes and channels simultaneously, teachers can ease working memory load and reinforce language meaning (Mayer, Lee, & Peebles, 2014; Sweller, 2005).

2.2. Audio-Visual Materials and Second Language Acquisition

Several researchers have undertaken studies in the field of audiovisual materials and Second Language Acquisition (SLA) to test the impact of different types of subtitles on written production, listening comprehension, oral skills, pronunciation, and grammar of EFL learners. Danan (2004) reviewed the effects of both captioning and subtitling on language learning skills. She highlighted the facilitating effect of captioning as learners visualize what they hear and the additional cognitive benefits caused by standard subtitles, which result in deeper processing and better recognition and recall. However, the results of the study undertaken by Bairstow and Lavaur (2012) showed that the inter-lingual condition resulted in better comprehension than the intra-lingual subtitles for the language learners with different proficiency levels. In contrast, the intralingual condition has a more significant impact on lexical learning in comparison to comprehension.

A detailed review of the studies on the use of audio-visual materials in teaching shows (e.g., Bravo, 2008, 2010; Winke, Gass, & Sydorenko, 2010) that the captioned and subtitled movies are more beneficial than the non-captioned ones. The common finding of the reviewed studies is that language learners exposed to the captioned/subtitled movies perform better on vocabulary and comprehension tests than do the language learners who are exposed to original movies. Likewise, other scholars (Bravo, 2008; Danan, 2004; Lertola, 2012; Talaván, 2007, 2013) highlighted the significance of interlingual subtitles in second language acquisition. For instance, D'Ydewalle and Van de Poel (1999) attempted to investigate whether or not watching subtitled movies increase the young and adult language learners' comprehension of the second language. They found that young language learners acquired more vocabulary when the native language was used in the subtitles but the foreign language in the audio whereas adults learned best from reverse subtitling (native language in the audio but the foreign language in the subtitles). They also found that adults learn more new words when materials are presented visually rather than auditorily.

Frumuselu, et al. (2015) sought to explore informal and conversational speech, such as slang, phrasal verbs, and colloquial expressions through the use of subtitled TV series amongst learners in higher education. They selected 40 Spanish/Catalan, Dutch, German, Russian, Romanian, and Moldavian undergraduates, in the province of Catalonia (Spain) with an A2 to the C1 proficiency level of CEFR. The participants were assigned to two conditions: interlingual mode (English sound + Spanish subtitles) and intralingual mode (English sound + English subtitles). They were exposed to a total of 13 subtitled episodes from the American series 'Friends' over seven weeks. They found that learners performed better under the EE (intralingual) than under the ES

(interlingual) mode. The results of their study were in line with the principles outlined by the Cognitive Theory of Multimedia Learning and Theory of Cognitive Load.

While the results of the majority of the studies show that the type of subtitling is an influencing factor in vocabulary learning (D'Ydewalle & Van de Poel, 1999; Gorjian, 2014), and developing language learners' listening skills (Kusumarasdyati, 2005), it is not easy to determine which type of subtitling is most effective and results are somehow inconclusive. For example, Zanon (2007) argued that texts in the form of subtitles help language learners monitor a speech that might be lost otherwise. Non-subtitled TV programs and films can create insecurity and anxiety among the students, while the subtitled films provide positive reinforcement and instant feedback that can create confidence in learners, help language learners feel motivated to watch the film in and out of the classrooms. The findings of the study undertaken by Baltova (1999) verified that bimodal videos subtitled in L2 proved to be effective for enhancing L2 learners' comprehending authentic texts and learning vocabulary because the students were simultaneously exposed to printed text, spoken language, and visual information. Similarly, Guichon and McLornan (2008) reported that bimodal subtitling (L2) was more effective than L1 subtitling because it resulted in less lexical interference. Also, the findings of Zarei (2009), Fazilatfar, et al. (2011), and Aydin Yildiz (2017) revealed that L2 subtitling was more effective than standard subtitling (L1 subtitling), which in turn, was more effective than reversed subtitling.

In another study in Iranian context, Mardani and Najmabadi (2016) nvestigates the effect of different types of subtitles on incidental vocabulary learning among Iranian EFL learners. To this end, 60 high school students in Behbahan were selected after taking a proficiency test. They assigned the participants randomly to three experimental groups, namely, Bimodal group (A), Standard group (B) and Reversed group (C). To arrive at any difference between the three different types of subtitles, the researchers conducted one-way ANOVA. The results showed that participants in reversed subtitling group performed significantly different and learned more new vocabulary items. Standard subtitling was the second type of subtitling which revealed to be more effective than bimodal subtitling. They also found that there was no significant difference between male and female in incidental English vocabulary learning.

Saed, et al., (2016) investigated whether exposing the language learners to an intralingually subtitled film can improve their listening comprehension or not. To do so, they carried out an experiment in which two groups of five intermediate level students studying in Chabahar maritime university were exposed to a series of videos was designed. One group watched the videos with English subtitle and the other group without any subtitles. After using independent T-test the p value (p=.000), they found that the group which received English subtitled movies performed better that the group

which received no subtitled movies. Similarly, Sabouri and Zohrabi (2015) investigated whether there were significant differences between males and females in learning vocabulary when watching subtitled movies. They employed a quantitative quasi-experimental approach with a pre-test and post-test group design. They found regardless of the genre of subtitled movie, males and females' scores were not significantly different from each other. Second, with the implementation of a subtitled movie, the participants in experimental group performed significantly better than participants of the control groups in both genders. They concluded that the use of movies with subtitles can improve students' engagement in learning and retrieval of new lexical items.

Napikul, et al (2018) tried to find out which type of subtitles is likely to be more effective in developing EFL tenth-grade students' listening comprehension and vocabulary of a feature film: bimodal subtitling (English subtitles with English dialogues), standard subtitling (Thai subtitles with English dialogues), and English dialogues without subtitles. Their findings showed that Thai subtitles affected tenth-grade students' listening comprehension more than English subtitles and movies with no subtitles. The average scores for content and vocabulary showed that Thai subtitles affected students' listening comprehension of content and vocabulary more than English subtitles and movies with no subtitles. Similarly, in Algeria, Bellaem, et al., (2018) recruited a sample of participants for the research and randomly divided them into control group, those who were asked to watch a movie without subtitles, and treatment group, those who were exposed to the movie with subtitles. The two groups were later asked to complete a Vocabulary Test (VT), which involved thirty vocabulary items identified from the movie. They found that that using subtitled movies clearly enhanced the learning of new vocabulary, and that the vocabulary acquisition of the treatment group was much greater than the acquisition of the control group.

Recently, Alharthi (2020) found that watching an English subtitled movie had a positive effect on the learning of vocabulary, for both recognition and recall; however, study participants scored significantly higher on receptive than productive tasks. Regarding parts of speech, most of the vocabulary items learnt were nouns, followed by verbs and adjectives.

3. Method

In the following sections, the main subsections of the research method including participants, instrumentation, procedure, and data analysis techniques are explained in details.

3.1. Participants

To undertake the study, two groups of participants were selected: participants for the treatment phase and participants for the qualitative phase. The participants of the first phase were 60 Turkish EFL learners studying at different branches of a language institute in Turkey. They were all English language learners and their age ranged from 17 to 28 years (average 21 ± 2.2 years). The participants were selected from pre-intermediate classes, based on the language institute assessment procedure and rubrics. For convenience and feasibility of running the study, 3 intact classes (A, B, & C), each consisting of 20 pre-intermediate language learners were selected. Class A was labelled the control group and the other two classes were coded as experimental group 1 (L1 subtitled films) and experimental group 2 (L2 subtitles). To check the initial differences among the groups, the researcher administered a placement test consisting of two modules: comprehension of movies and speaking about the movies. The sampling strategy for the selection of the participants was convenience sampling. Furthermore, to undertake the second phase of the study, the researcher employed theoretical sampling to select the required sample for the qualitative phase. The rationale for the sample size for this phase of the study was the data saturation point which occurred when no further information from the interviewees of each group was obtained. The data saturation for the participants in experimental group 1 occurred when the 10th language learner was interviewed, while the data saturation for the experimental group 2 occurred when the 8th language learners was interviewed. Therefore, 10 of participants in the experimental group 1 and 8 participants in the experimental group 2 were selected. All the participants were aware of the purpose of the study and they all signed the consent form. They were also assured that the data would be kept confidential and they would be allowed to withdraw from the study at any stage of the research

3.2. Design

In line with the research questions, a sequential mixed method research design was employed, using a quasi-experimental quantitative phase and a subsequent qualitative case study. To answer the quantitative research questions (1 & 2), a quasi-experimental was used. The schematic representation of the quantitative phase is as follows in Table 1.

Table 1. Schematic Representation of the Quantitative Phase

Groups	Pretest	Posttest	Treatment
Experimental 1:	Pretests 1& 2	Posttests 1 & 2	L1 Subtitled
Experimental 2:	Pretests 1& 2	Posttests 1 & 2	L2 Subtitled
Control group:	Pretests 1& 2	Posttests 1 & 2	Original movies

However, to undertake the second phase of the study, a qualitative research design was used. The data was collected through interviews with the participants and analyzed through content analysis techniques.

3.3. Instruments

Three different instruments were used in this study. Each is explained as follows.

3.3.1. Pre-test

The pretest consisted of two modules. The first module consisted of true-false, fill in the blanks, and multiple-choice items which aimed at measuring the language learners' ability to comprehend the two selected movies: Shooter and 88 minutes. The second module consisted of 10 open-ended questions about the plot, events, characters, and settings of the above-mentioned movies. The reliability of the listening section was estimated through employing KR-21, while the reliability of the speaking section was estimated through the inter-rater reliability approach. That is, the speaking ability of the test takers was evaluated by two raters, and then the correlation coefficient between the scores given by the two raters was estimated through running Pearson Product correlation. The reliability of the listening module was reported to be 0.72, while the reliability of the speaking module was 0.83.

3.3.2. Post-test

Like the pre-test, the post-test consisted of two modules. The first module consisted of true-false, fill in blanks, and multiple-choice items which aimed at measuring the language learners' ability to comprehend the two selected movies: Shooter and 88 minutes. The second module consisted of 10 open-ended questions about the plot, events, characters, and settings of the above-mentioned movies. The reliability of the listening section was estimated by running KR-21, while the reliability of the speaking section was estimated through the inter-rater reliability approach. That is, the speaking ability of the test takers was evaluated by two ratters, and then the

correlation coefficient between the scores given by the two raters was estimated through running Pearson Product correlation. The reliability indices of the listening module and the speaking module were 0.82 and 0.87, respectively.

3.3.3. Movies

Two movies were used in this study. The first movie was 88 minutes (L1 subtitled, L2 subtitled, and Original). The second movie was Shooter (L1 subtitled, L2 subtitled, and Original).

3.3.4. Interview checklist

The interview checklist consisted of some open-ended questions which were asked to elicit the participants' perceptions about the use of subtitled movies in EFL classes, their preferences, attitudes, etc.

3.4. Procedure

The present study was undertaken in two phases. In the first phase which fell within the quantitative research paradigm, the researcher used a quasi-experimental study to investigate the effect of three different types of instruction on EFL learners' comprehension and speaking about the movies. In the first step of this phase, movies and materials for teaching were prepared. Then, among the intact classes, six pre-intermediate classes were selected, based on the language institute's evaluation procedure. Then, among the students in the intact classes, 60 were recruited, based on their scores on the placement test and willingness to watch movies. The selected participants were divided into three groups. The two movies were played to them twice. Then, they received the pre-test. After checking the initial homogeneity of the groups on the onset of the study, group A watched the original movies twice, group B watched the L1 subtitled movies, and group C watched L2 subtitled movies. At the end of the treatment, all groups received the same post-test.

Finally, each participant was coded, the scores on pre-test and post-test were entered into SPSS and appropriate data analysis tests were run. To investigate the effect of each instruction approach, at first, the mean scores on the pre-test were compared through a One-Way ANOVA. Moreover, to see which instruction was more effective, the mean scores of the groups on the post tests were submitted to separate one-way ANOVAs, as well as a post-hoc test (Bonferroni).

After analysing and reporting the quantitative findings of the study, the researcher selected 10 participants from experimental group 1 and 8 from the experimental group 2. They were interviewed and the participants' perceptions were coded and categorized thematically. The interviews with the participants were conducted in English. To elicit

language learners' in-depth perceptions, the interviewer allowed the conversation to move on smoothly in a more interactive manner. Each interview consisted of questions that addressed the participants' perceptions about the effectiveness of L1 and L2 subtitled films. Radnor's (2001) guide to qualitative data analysis was employed for analysing the data. Interviews were first transcribed and multiple copies of the transcripts were printed. The transcripts were then read for topic order to draw out and list topics linked to the original research questions of the study. A second meticulous reading of transcripts helped the researcher identify the explicit and implicit categories which emerge within each topic. The categories were color-coded. In case of more than one category in a topic, numeric coding was used. The third reading for content helped to identify quotes that are aligned with each category within the topics. The quotes were labelled according to the categories they represented.

4. Results
4.1. Research question 1

The first research question aimed at investigating the impact of watching L1 and L2 subtitled English movies on improving EFL learners' speaking about movies. Having checked the assumptions of the parametric data (normality assumption and homogeneity of the variances), the groups' mean scores on the speaking post-test were submitted to an ANOVA test, and a post-hoc test (Bonferroni). Results are presented in Tables 2, 3, and 4.

Table 2. Descriptive Statistics of the Groups' Scores on Speaking Post-test

Test	Groups	N	Mean	SD
Speaking 1	L1 subtitled	20	21.55	2.06
	L2 Subtitled	20	19.15	2.109
	Without subtitles	20	16.20	1.39

Table 2 indicates the mean scores of the L1 subtitled group, L2 subtitles, and without subtitles groups on the speaking test are 21.55, 19.15, and 16.20, respectively, which seemed to be different. However, to check whether the differences were statistically significant or not, one-way ANOVA test was run. Results are presented in Table 3.

Table 3. ANOVA Test for Comparing the Groups' Variances on Speaking about the Films

		Sum of Squares	df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
Speaking test 2	Between Groups	287.233	2	143.617	40.386	.001
	Within Groups	202.700	57	3.556		
	Total	489.933	59			

Table 3 shows the variances of the three groups' scores on speaking post-test were statistically different (F (2, 57) = 143.61, p = 0.001< 0.05). Therefore, it could be strongly argued that L1 subtitled and L2 subtitled movies have a significant impact on Turkish EFL learners' speaking about the movies. To locate the sources of differences, a post-test Hoc test was run. Results are presented in Table 4.

Table 4. Results of Bonferroni Test for Comparing the Three Groups' Mean Scores

Dependent Variable	(I) groups	(J) groups	Mean Difference (I-J)	Sig.
Speaking test	L1 subtitled	L2 Subtitled	2.400	.001
		Without subtitles	5.35000*	.001
	L2 subtitled	Without subtitles	2.95000*	.001

Table 4 indicates that the difference between the L1 subtitled and L2 subtitled groups is statistically significant, favouring L1 subtitled group (p=0.001, mean difference=2.4). Results also show that the difference between L2 subtitled and without subtitles is significant, favouring the L2 subtitled group (p=0.001). Therefore, it can be strongly argued that watching L1 and watching L2 subtitled English movies does not have the same impact on improving pre-intermediate EFL learners' speaking about the movies. That is, watching L1 subtitled more significantly contributes to enhancing EFL learners' ability in speaking about the movies than does L2 subtitled movies.

4.2. Research Question 2

The second research question aimed at investigating the impact of watching L1 and L2 subtitled English movies on improving EFL learners' comprehension of movies. Having checked the safety checks of ANOVA (normal distribution, homogeneity of variances), the groups' mean scores on the comprehension post-test were submitted to an ANOVA test, and a post-hoc test (Bonferroni). Results are presented in Tables 5, 6, and 7.

Table 5. Descriptive Statistics of the Groups' Scores on Film Recognition Post-test

Test	Groups	N	Mean	SD
Comprehension test1	L1 subtitled	20	22.35	1.78
	L2 Subtitled	20	18.00	1.45
	Without subtitles	20	16.3	2.08

Based on Table 5, the mean scores of the L1 subtitled group, L2 subtitles, and without subtitles groups on the speaking test are 22.35, 18.00, and 16.35, respectively, which seemed to be different. However, to check whether the differences were statistically significant or not, one-way ANOVA test was run. Results are presented in Table 6.

Table 6. ANOVA Test for Comparing the Groups' Variances on Film Comprehension

		Sum of Squares	df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
Comprehension test 2	Between Groups	810.300	2	405.150	126.125	.001
	Within Groups	183.100	57	3.212		
	Total	993.400	59			

As shown in Table 6, the variances of the three groups' scores on film comprehension post-test were statistically different (F (2, 57) = 405.12, p= 0.001< 0.05). Therefore, it could be strongly argued that L1 subtitled and L2 subtitled movies have a significant impact on Turkish EFL learners' film comprehension. To locate the sources of differences, a post-test Hoc test was run. Results are presented in Table 7.

Table 7. Results of Bonferroni Test for Comparing the Three Groups' Mean Scores

Dependent Variable	(I) groups	(J) groups	Mean Difference (I-J)	Sig.
comprehension test	L1 subtitled	L2 Subtitled	4.3*	.001
		Without subtitles	6.00*	.001
	L2 subtitled	Without subtitles	3.7*	.001

Table 7 shows that the difference between the L1 subtitled and L2 subtitled groups is statistically significant, favouring L1 subtitled group (p=0.001, mean difference=4.3). Results also show that the difference between L2 subtitled and without subtitles is significant, favouring the L2 subtitled group (p=0.001, mean difference=3.7). Therefore, it can be strongly argued that watching L1 and watching L2 subtitled English movies does not have the same impact on improving pre-intermediate EFL learners' film comprehension. That is, watching L1 subtitled movies more significantly contribute to enhancing EFL learners' film comprehension than do L2 subtitled movies.

4.3. Research Question 3: Learners' Perceptions

The third research question aimed at exploring the participants' attitudes about the use of subtitled movies in EFL classes. The interviews with the participants were content analysed. In the following sections, the qualitative findings are presented.

A. Movies with subtitles facilitate comprehension.

Eight of the language learners exposed to movies with L1 subtitles and 6 of those exposed to movies with L2 subtitles believed that subtitles facilitate comprehension because they do not need to concentrate on the content to guess the meaning of unknown words and expressions. The following quotations exemplify the theme.

"I'd like to see the films with L1 subtitles because Turkish subtitle makes me understand dialogues and monologues, and details of the movies.

"If there are English subtitles, it is easy for me   to understand the movies."

"The English subtitle makes me know more native English."

B. Movies with subtitles increase the viewers' motivation and interest.

Among the interviewed participants, 15 (75%) argued that watching movies with subtitles increase their interest and motivation, but they do not like watching movies without subtitles. The following quotations exemplify the theme.

"I would feel less interested in watching the movies if there are no subtitles in English or Turkish."

"If there is no subtitle, I will be confused and I will not enjoy the film."

C. *Movies with subtitles increase language learners' vocabulary knowledge.*

Interestingly, seven of the interviewees exposed to L1 subtitled movies mentioned that L1 subtitles can help them compare the Turkish translation and learn new words. As an example, one of them argued:

"I can understand the movies and TV series without subtitles very well, but L2l subtitles can be a good reference. It helps me to recheck things I am not sure about and learn some unknown expressions and words."

D. Subtitle raises students' awareness in general and noticing in particular.

Another extracted theme as reported by 60% of the participants is that subtitle raises students' awareness in general and noticing in particular. The participants of the study argued that they are aware of the sentence structures, spellings of the words, and notice the spelling of the words and sentence structures. For instance, participant 3 mentioned:

Through subtitled I noticed the correct spelling of the words and the correct order of the words in a sentence

E. Subtitles help learners establish an association between form (sound and spelling) and meaning.

The majority of the participants argued that through watching subtitled movies, they make an association between word sound and the spelling of the words. They also believed that through making association between sound and spelling, the words stick to their minds and they can easily retrieve them. The following exert from the interviews exemplify the theme:

Through watching subtitled movies, the language learners can make an association between the pronunciation of the words and their spellings.

F. Subtitles help learners develop collocation competence.

Through watching subtitled movies many times, they can learn collocations. One of the participants argued when I see the collocations in the texts, I can easily learn them. Movies are full of many collocations, which are rarely seen in our textbooks. This is confirmed by the quotation from participant 10 who stated:

When movies are subtitled, I can see the collocations although I may not understand them while watching the original movies

G. Watching movies engage learners' different aspects such as affections, imagination, and language.

While watching movies, language learners' affections, imagination, and the use of language are all involved. This idea is also reflected in the theory of multidimensional processing suggested by Tomlinson (2000). A multi-dimensional approach aims to help learners to develop the ability to produce and process an L2 by using their mental resources in ways similar to those they use when communicating in their L1. This is supported by participant 3 who stated "subtitling not only helps learners to maximize their brain's potential for communicating in an L2 but also maximizes their brain's potential for learning". We seem to learn things "best when we see things as part of a recognized pattern, when our imaginations are aroused when we make natural associations between one idea and another, and when the information appeals to our senses." (Berman, 1999, p. 2, as cited in Tomlinson, 2003, p. 20). In other words, using effect, mental imagery, and inner speech is not only what we do during language use but also what we do to learn.

H. Watching movies provides an authentic-sociocultural context in which words are appropriately used.

The next extracted theme is that through watching movies, language learners are provided with an authentic-socio-cultural context. In such contexts, words, collocations, and idioms are appropriately used. Subtitled films can also help the language learners to both hear and see the words and phrases in the context. One of the participants stated:

Movies are authentic sources for learning English language. I learners a lot of collocation and idioms through watching movies most particularly when the movies are subtitled

I. Watching movies provokes self-talk/ private speech (socio-cultural theory) and natural imitation.

The last extracted theme as mentioned by 40% of the participants is that through watching subtitled movies, the learners have the chance to have self-talk, private speech, and natural imagination. Also, such self-talk and natural imagination as they lead to vocal and non-vocal repetition can improve the language learners' production and comprehension. The following quotation exemplify the theme:

While watching subtitled movies, language learners through self-talk and natural imagination can improve their language production and comprehension.

5. Discussion

This study investigated the impact of L1 subtitled, L2 subtitled, and standard movies on EFL learners' ability to comprehend and speak about the movies. The first main finding was that subtitled movies have a more significant impact on the language learners' speaking ability than do the movies without subtitles and the second main finding was that L1 subtitles help students acquire the content more than L2 subtitles and no subtitles. Turkish subtitles seem to be an effective instrument to help students learn English through English dialogue movies. This finding is consistent with several studies including Koskinen et al. (1996), Markham & McCarthy (2003), Napikul, Cedar, and Roongrattanakoo (2018), Wang (2014), and Frumuselu, et al (2015) who found that L1 subtitles helped students to understand the movies.

The findings also lend support to the results of a large number of the studies on the use of films with subtitles and captions in EFF classrooms (Araújo, 2008; Bird & Williams, 2002; Bravo, 2008, 2010; Caimi, 2015; Danan, 1992, 2004, 2015; Gambier, 2006; Talaván, 2007, 2010, 2011, 2013; Vanderplank, 1988, 2010) which shed light on their facilitating effect on both formal and incidental language learning and on a variety of language skills.

Findings show that language learners who watched American TV series with subtitles (L1Turkish, L2 English,) performed significantly higher than the language learners exposed to watching movies without subtitles. This finding is in line with previous studies that suggested subtitled videos have positive effects on language learning (Brett, 1995; Chai & Erlam, 2008; Danan, 2004; Markham & Peter, 2003; Winke et al., 2010). Because most of the studies conducted research on L1 and L2 subtitles under two treatments, this study reveals a significant finding that not only L1and, L2 subtitles are helpful to learners, but also dual subtitles are helpful.

This study found that language learners who watched videos with Turkish subtitles condition outscored no subtitle condition. This finding is echoing the results of the studies by Guichon and McLornan (2008), Zarei (2009), and Fazilatfar, et al. (2011) and Aydin Yildiz (2017) who reported that bimodal subtitling (L2 subtitling) was more effective than L1 subtitling which was more effective than original movies because L1 subtitling resulted in less lexical interference. However, the findings are not consistent with Markham and Peter (2003), whose students who watched videos with L2 English outperformed those with L1 Spanish subtitles. This might be due to the different language that was being investigated. In this study, students performed the worst when watched videos with no subtitles. This indicates that students may encounter difficulty understanding when watching American TV series without subtitles. This was in line with Winke et al. (2010) who showed that subtitles worked as an aid in comprehension.

Moreover, interviewees stated that listening to and reading English at the same time could help them learn new words and improve English language listening and reading skills. This comment echoes the findings of the studies by Danan (1992) who believed that listening to and reading the text simultaneously could help students distinguish known from unknown words; further, it confirms the study by Garza (1991) whose findings show that subtitles help students to remember some difficult vocabulary. In addition, through watching subtitled movies, learners' different aspects such as affections, imagination, and language are engaged. This idea is also reflected in the theory of multidimensional processing suggested by Tomlinson (2000). A multi-dimensional approach aims to help learners to develop the ability to produce and process an L2 by using their mental resources in ways similar to those they use when communicating in their L1. Doing so not only helps learners to maximize their brain's potential for communicating in an L2 but also maximizes their brain's potential for learning. The language learners seem to learn things "best when we see things as part of a recognized pattern, when our imaginations are aroused when we make natural associations between one idea and another, and when the information appeals to our senses." (Berman, 1999, p. 2).

Therefore, as Danan (2004) believed, while watching subtitled movies learners visualize what they hear and they can enjoy additional cognitive benefits caused by standard subtitles, which in turn result in deeper processing and better recognition and recall. The findings are also echoing of the Multimedia Learning Theory proposed by Mayer (2009) and Paivio's (1986) bilingual Dual Coding Theory, which claims that the imagery and verbal system, composed of events and nonverbal objects, are linked by referential connections but they are functionally independent. The results are therefore in line with the principles outlined by the Cognitive Theory of Multimedia Learning and Theory of Cognitive Load. Therefore, it can be strongly argued that learning English

through subtitles can help students know more about English. Moreover, subtitles may increase the language learners' ability to translate efficiently.

6. Conclusion

In line with Vygotsky's Zone of Proximal Development (ZPD) (1978), it is concluded subtitles can serve as a mediation part of the theory in which "learner can do with help." Subtitled movies give learners the necessary help and hints in comprehending the movies. Subtitles can work as a mediator and a facilitator to help students to perform beyond their current performance level. In multimedia environments, subtitled audio-visual materials can be used as controlled-pace and a self-pace choice for EFL students' autonomous learning. In this way, language learners can make decisions about which type of subtitled movies to watch based on their language proficiency levels, the difficulty level of the movies, their objectives, and needs.

According to Brett (1997), multimedia materials can significantly affect the language learners' comprehension skills. Therefore, multimedia materials, audio-visual materials accompanied with texts captioned in either L1 or L2 can be used in foreign language education. The subtitled movies provide comprehensible input just above the language learner's level of linguistic competence, which According to Krashen (1982), leads to second language acquisition. Similarly, VanPatten (2004) stated that rich input can promote second language acquisition. As educational TV series and subtitled movies provide authentic input, EFL teachers appropriately use them based on the students' needs and proficiency level.

7. Pedagogical Implications

This study has several pedagogical implications. Generally speaking, subtitles can be used as valuable authentic audio-visual materials in EFL classroom settings. Language learners can use subtitles in and outside of the classrooms. They can also be used to increase the language learners' autonomous learning, motivation and interest. Subtitled movies can also decrease negative filters such as foreign language anxiety in general, listening anxiety, and speaking anxiety in particular. Therefore, to prepare the language learners for listening classes, teachers are recommended to provide both L1 and L2 subtitled movies. Moreover, while being exposed to subtitle movies, language learners enjoy themselves and have fun.

8. Recommendation

As this study was undertaken in a particular context through selecting language learners with a particular language proficiency level, the findings need to be generalized carefully. The other researcher can replicate the study by recruiting a larger number of participants with different language proficiency levels to see how and whether the

different findings are obtained. More importantly, the other researchers are suggested to replicate the study to see whether subtitled movies have the same impact on learning language pronunciation, grammar, and super segmental features such as stress and intonation.

References

Aksu-Ataç, A., & Köprülü-Günay, S. (2018). The role of subtitle in foreign language teaching. *International Online Journal of Education and Teaching (IOJET), 5*(3). 525-533.

Aktaş, T. (2005). Communicative competence in foreign language teaching. *Journal of Language Linguistic Studies, 1*(1), 89-100.

Alharthi, T. (2020). Can adults learn vocabulary through watching subtitled movies? An experimental corpus-based approach. *International Journal of English Language and Literature Studies, 9*(3), 219-230.

Alkhatnai, M. (2010). The Effect of TV Captions on the Comprehension of Non-Native Saudi Learners of English. *ICT for Language Learning Conference*. Retrieved from https://conference.pixel-online.net/conferences/ICT4LL2010/common/download/Proceedings_pdf/ILT 13-Alkhatnai.pdf

Angers, J., & Machtmes, K. (2005). An ethnographic-case study of beliefs, context factors, and practices of teachers integrating technology. *The Qualitative Report Volume, 10*(4)*, 771-794.

Araújo, V. L. S. (2008). The educational use of subtitled films in EFL teaching. In J. Díaz Cintas (Ed.), *The didactics of audiovisual translation*. Amsterdam: JohnBenjamins Publishing Company.

Aydin Yildiz, T. (2017). The Effect of videos with subtitles on vocabulary learning of EFL learners. International *Journal of Humanities and Social Science, 7*, 125-130.

Bairstow, D. & Lavaur, J.-M. (2012). Audiovisual information processing by monolinguals and bilinguals: Effects of intralingual and interlingual subtitles. In A. Remael, P. Orero, and M. Carroll (Eds.) *Audiovisual translation and media accessibility at the crossroads: Media for all 3.* (pp. 273-293). Amsterdam: Rodopi.

Baltova, I. (1999). Multisensory language teaching in a multidimensional curriculum: The use of authentic bimodal video in core French. *The Canadian Modern Language Review, 56*(1), 31-48. https://doi.org/10.3138/cmlr.56.1.31

Bellalem, F., Neddar, B. A., Bouagada, H., & Djelloul, D. B. (2018). The Use of Subtitled Movies for Vocabulary Acquisition in ESP Settings: Insights from an Experimental Study in Algeria. *Arab World English Journal, 9* (3), 3-16

Bird, S.A., & Williams, J.N. (2002). The effect of bimodal input on implicit and explicit memory: An investigation into the benefits of within-language subtitling. *Applied Psycholinguistics*, *23*(4), 509-533.

Blasco, P.G., Moreto, G., Roncoletta, A.F., Levites, M.R., & Janaudis, M.A. (2006). Using movie clips to foster learners' reflection: improving education in the affective domain. *Family Medicine-kansas City, 38,* 94-96.

Butler, A.C., Zaromb, F. M., Lyle, K. B., & Roediger, H. L. (2009). Using popular films to enhance classroom learning the good, the bad, and the interesting. *Psychological Science, 20,* 1161-1168.

Bravo, M. D. C. C. (2008). *Putting the reader in the picture. Screen translation and foreign-language learning*. Rovira i Virgili University. Retrieved from http://tdx.cat/bitstream/handle/10803/8771/Condhino.pdf?sequence=1

Bravo, M. D. C. C. (2010). Text on screen and text on air: A useful tool for foreign language teachers and learners. In J. Díaz-Cintas, A. Matamala, & J. Neves(Eds.), *New insights into audiovisual translation and media* (pp. 269–283). Amsterdam: Rodopi.

Brett, P. (1995). Multimedia for listening comprehension: The design of a multi-media based resource for developing listening skills. *System, 23,* 1-10.

Brett, P. (1997). A comparative study of the effects of the use of multimedia on listening comprehension. *System*, *25*(1), 39–53.

Caimi, A. (2015). Introduction. In Y. Gambier, A. Caimi, & C. Mariotti (Eds.), *Subtitles and language learning. principles, strategies, and practical experiences* (pp. 9–18). Bern, New York: Peter Lang.

Casper, W.J., Champoux, J.E., Watt, J.D., Bachiochi, P.D., Schleicher, D.J., & Bordeaux, C. (2003). Feature film as a resource in teaching IO psychology. T*he Industrial Organizational Psychologist*, *41*, 83-95.

Chai, J., & Erlam, R. (2008). The Effect and the Influence of the Use of Video and Captions on Second Language Learning. *New Zealand Studies in Applied Linguistics*, *14*(2), 25–44.

Champoux, J.E. (1999). Film as a teaching resource. *Journal of management inquiry*, *8*, 206-217.

Danan, M. (1992). Reversed Subtitling and Dual Coding Theory: New Directions for Foreign Language Instruction. *Language Learning*, *42*(4), 497–527.

Danan, M. (2004). Captioning and subtitling: Undervalued language learning strategies. *Meta, 49* (1), 67-77.

Danan, M. (2015). Subtitling as a language learning tool: past findings, current applications, and future paths. In Y. Gambier, A. Caimi, & C. Mariotti (Eds.), *Subtitles and Language Learning. Principles, strategies and practical experiences* (pp. 41–61). Bern, New York: Peter Lang.

D'Ydewalle, G., & Van de Poel, M. (1999). Incidental foreign-language acquisition by children watching subtitled television programs. *Journal of Psycholinguistic Research, 28*(3), 227–244. https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1023202130625

Fazilatfar, A. M., Ghorbani, S., & Samavarchi, L. (2011). The effect of standard and reversed subtitling versus no subtitling mode on L2 vocabulary learning. *The Journal of Teaching Language Skills, 30*, 43-64.

Frumuselu, A. D., Maeyer, S. D., Donche, V., & Plana, M. D. M. G. C. (2015). Television series inside the EFL classroom: Bridging the gap between teaching and learning informal language through subtitles. *Linguistics and Education, 32*(Part B), 107-166.

Garza, T. J. (1991). Evaluating the use of captioned video materials in advanced foreign language learning. *Foreign Language Annals, 24(3).* 239-258. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1944-9720.1991.tb00469.x

Gass, S. M. (1997). *Input, interaction and the second language learner*. Mahwah N.J.: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

Gambier, Y. (2006). Multimodality and audiovisual translation. In MuTra 2006 – Audiovisual translation scenarios: Conference proceedings (pp. 1–8). Retrieved from http://www.euroconferences.info/proceedings/2006_Proceedings/2006_Gambie r_Yves.pdf

Gorjian, B. (2014). The effect of movie subtitling on incidental vocabulary learning among EFL learners. *International Journal of Asian Social Science*, *4*(9), 1013-1026.

Guichon, N., & McLornan, S. (2008). The effects of multimodality on L2 learners: Implications for CALL resource design. *System, 36*, 85-93.

Harmer, J. (2002). *The practice of English Language Teaching: 3rd edition*. Malaysia: Longman.

Hefer, E. (2013). Television subtitles and literacy: where do we go from here? *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, *34*(7), 636–652.

Kothari, B. (2008). Let a Billion Readers Bloom: Same Language Subtitling (SLS) on Television for Mass Literacy. *International Review of Education*, *54*(5-6), 773-780.

Kothari, B., Takeda, J., Joshi, A., & Pandey, A. (2002). Same language subtitling: a butterfly for literacy? *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, *21*(1), 55–66.

Krashen, S. D. (1985). *The Input Hypothesis: Issue and implications*. New York: Longman.

Koskinen, P. Knable, J., Markham, P., Jensema, C., & Kane, K. (1996). Captioned television and the vocabulary acquisition of adult second language correctional facility residents. *Journal of Educational Technology Systems, 24*, 359-373.

Kusumarasdyati. (2005). Incorporating culture into listening comprehension through presentation of movies. *TEFLIN Journal,16*(1), 54-70. https://doi.org/10.15639/teflinjournal.v16i1/54-70.

Lertola, J. (2012). The effect of the subtitling task on vocabulary learning. In A. Pym & D. Orrego-Carmona (Eds.), *Translation research projects, Vol.*4, (pp. 61-70). Tarragona: Intercultural Studies Group.

Mardani, M., & Najmabadi, A. (2016). The effect of movies with different types of subtitles on incidental English vocabulary learning of Iranian high school students. *Research in Language Pedagogy, 4*(1), 52-63.

Markham, P. & McCarthy, T.J. (2003). The effects of native language vs. target language captions on foreign language students' DVD video comprehension. *Foreign Language Annals, 34*, 439-445.

Mayer, R. E. (2009). *Multimedia learning* (2nd ed.). Cambridge University Press.

Mayer, R. E., Lee, H., & Peebles, A. (2014). Multimedia learning in a second language: A cognitive load perspective. *Applied Cognitive Psychology, 28*(5), 653–660. https://doi.org/10.1002/acp.3050

Mayer, R. E. & Moreno, R. (2002). Animation as an Aid to Multimedia Learning. *Educational Psychology Review, 14*(1), 87–99.

McCarthy, M. (1998). *Spoken language and applied linguistics*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Napikul, S., Cedar, P., & Roongrattanakool, D. (2018). The effects of film subtitles on English listening comprehension and vocabulary. *International Journal of Applied Linguistics & English Literature, 7*(6), 104-110.

Paivio, A. (1986). *Mental representations: A dual coding approach*. New York: Oxford Pschology Series No 9.

Radnor, H. (2001). *Researching your professional practice*. Buckingham: Open University Press.

Rokni, S. J. A., & Ataee, A. J. (2014). Movies in EFL classrooms: With or without subtitles. *The Dawn Journal, 3*(1), 715-726.

Sabouri, H., & Zohrabi, M. (2015). The impact of watching English subtitled movies in vocabulary learning in different genders of Iranian EFL learners. *International Journal on Studies in English Language and Literature (IJSELL)*, 3(2), 110-125.

Saed, A., Yazdani, A., & Askari, M. (2016). Film subtitles and listening comprehension ability of intermediate EFL learners. *International Journal of Applied Linguistics and Translation 2*(4), 42-56.

Sweller, J. (2005). Implications of cognitive load theory for multimedia learning. In R. E. Mayer (Ed.), *The Cambridge handbook of multimedia learning* (pp.19–30). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Talaván, N. Z. (2007). Learning vocabulary through authentic video and subtitles. TESOL-SPAIN Newsletter, 31, 5–8.

Talaván, N. Z. (2010). Subtitling as a task and subtitles as support: Pedagogical applications. In J. Díaz-Cintas, A. Matamala, & J. Neves (Eds.), *New insights into audiovisual translation and media* (pp. 285–299). Amsterdam: Rodopi.

Talaván, N. Z. (2011). A quasi-experimental research project on subtitling and foreign language acquisition. In L. Incalcaterra, M. Biscio, & M. A. Ní Mhainnín (Eds.), *Audiovisual translation: subtitles and subtitling: theory and practice* (pp. 197–218). Oxford : Peter Lang

Talaván, N. Z. (2013). *La Subtitulación En El Aprendizaje De Lenguas Extranjeras (Edición: 1)*. Barcelona: Octaedro.

Tomlinson, B. (2000). *A multi-dimensional approach*. The Language Teacher, 23, 25-27.

Tomlinson, B. (2003). *Developing materials for language teaching*. London: Continuum International Publishing Group.

Vanderplank, R. (1988). The value of teletext sub-titles in language learning. *ELT journal, 42*, 272-281.

Vanderplank, R. (2010). Déjà vu? A decade of research on language laboratories, television and video in language learning. *Language Teaching, 43*(1), 1–37.

Van de Poel, M., & D'Ydewalle, G. 2001). Incidental foreign-language acquisition by children watching subtitled television programs. In *(Multi) media Translation: Concepts, Practices and Research* (pp. 259–274). Amsterdam: John   Benjamins.

Vygotsky, L. S. (1978). *Mind   in society: The   development of higher psychological   processes*. Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.

Wang, Y. C. (2014). Learning L2 vocabulary with American TV drama from the learner's   perspective. *English Language Teaching, 5*(8), 217-225.

Winke, P., Gass, S., & Sydorenko, T. (2010). The effects of captioning videos used for foreign language listening activities. *Language Learning and Technology*, *14*(1), 65-86.

Zanon, N. T. (2007). Learning vocabulary through authentic video and subtitles. *TESOL Spain Newsletter, 31*, 5-8.

Zarei, A. A. (2009). The effect of bimodal, standard, and reversed subtitling on L2 vocabulary recognition and recall. *Pazhuhesh-e Zabanha-ye Khareji, 49*, 65-85.